

# Agenda

www.oxford.gov.uk



## Value and Performance Scrutiny Committee

Date: **Monday 5 November 2012**

---

Time: **5.30 pm**

---

Place: **St Aldate's Room, Town Hall**

---

For any further information please contact:

**Pat Jones, Principal Scrutiny Officer**

Telephone: 01865 252191

Email: [phjones@oxford.gov.uk](mailto:phjones@oxford.gov.uk)

---

# Value and Performance Scrutiny Committee

## Membership

<b>Chair</b>	<b>Councillor Mark Mills</b>	Holywell;
<b>Vice-Chair</b>	<b>Councillor Mike Rowley</b>	Barton and Sandhills;
	<b>Councillor Mohammed Abbasi</b>	Cowley Marsh;
	<b>Councillor Anne-Marie Canning</b>	Carfax;
	<b>Councillor Jean Fooks</b>	Summertown;
	<b>Councillor James Fry</b>	North;
	<b>Councillor Michael Gotch</b>	Wolvercote;
	<b>Councillor Mick Haines</b>	Marston;
	<b>Councillor Pat Kennedy</b>	Lye Valley;
	<b>Councillor Sajjad Malik</b>	Cowley Marsh;
	<b>Councillor Stuart McCready</b>	Summertown;
	<b>Councillor Craig Simmons</b>	St. Mary's;
	<b>Councillor Oscar Van Nooijen</b>	Hinksey Park;

### **HOW TO OBTAIN AGENDA**

In order to reduce the use of resources, our carbon footprint and our costs we will no longer produce paper copies of agenda over and above our minimum internal and Council member requirement. Paper copies may be looked at the Town Hall Reception and at Customer Services, St Aldate's and at the Westgate Library

A copy of the agenda may be:-

- Viewed on our website – [mycouncil.oxford.gov.uk](http://mycouncil.oxford.gov.uk)
- Downloaded from our website
- Subscribed to electronically by registering online at [mycouncil.oxford.gov.uk](http://mycouncil.oxford.gov.uk)
- Sent to you in hard copy form upon payment of an annual subscription.

## AGENDA

Pages

- |   |  |        |
|---|--|--------|
| 1 | <b>APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE AND SUBSTITUTIONS</b>                           |        |
| 2 | <b>DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST</b>  |        |
| 3 | <b>CALL-IN - PARKING IN PARKING AREAS ADJACENT TO PARKS - MONITORING</b> | 1 - 16 |

Contact Officer: Mathew Metcalfe  
Tel: 01865 252214, email: mmetcalfe@oxford.gov.uk

### **Background Information**

The City Executive Board at its meeting on 12<sup>th</sup> September 2012 received a report which presented a review of charging for parking in car parking areas adjacent to Parks which came into operation in September 2011. The report recommended that the charges should continue in each of the car parking areas to which they applied.

Attached to this agenda for information are:

- (1) A copy of the original report submitted to the City Executive Board;
- (2) An extract from the minutes from the City Executive Board meeting;
- (3) Further information detailing income from charges and penalties between September 2011 and 31<sup>st</sup> August 2012.

### **Why is it on the agenda?**

This item has been called-in to the Value and Performance Scrutiny Committee by the Chair (Councillor Mark Mills). The stated reasons for the call-in are to consider:

- (1) The impact on neighbouring areas.
- (2) The balance between revenue from charges and penalties (details attached).
- (3) Whether there are other factors in play which might be distorting the comparison of user numbers.

### **Who has been invited to comment?**

The Board Member, City Development, Councillor Colin Cook.

### **What will happen after the meeting?**

The Committee can either:

- (1) Disagree with the call-in which will mean the original City

Executive Board decision is made at this point;

- (2) Agree wholly or partly with the call-in and report to the next City Executive Board on 5<sup>th</sup> December 2012.

## **DECLARING INTERESTS**

### **General duty**

You must declare any disclosable pecuniary interests when the meeting reaches the item on the agenda headed “Declarations of Interest” or as soon as it becomes apparent to you.

### **What is a disclosable pecuniary interest?**

Disclosable pecuniary interests relate to your employment; sponsorship (ie payment for expenses incurred by you in carrying out your duties as a councillor or towards your election expenses); contracts; land in the Council’s area; licences for land in the Council’s area; corporate tenancies; and securities. These declarations must be recorded in each councillor’s Register of Interests which is publicly available on the Council’s website.

### **Declaring an interest**

Where any matter disclosed in your Register of Interests is being considered at a meeting, you must declare that you have an interest. You should also disclose the nature as well as the existence of the interest.

If you have a disclosable pecuniary interest, after having declared it at the meeting you must not participate in discussion or voting on the item and must withdraw from the meeting whilst the matter is discussed.

### **Members’ Code of Conduct and public perception**

Even if you do not have a disclosable pecuniary interest in a matter, the Members’ Code of Conduct says that a member “must serve only the public interest and must never improperly confer an advantage or disadvantage on any person including yourself” and that “you must not place yourself in situations where your honesty and integrity may be questioned”. What this means is that the matter of interests must be viewed within the context of the Code as a whole and regard should continue to be paid to the perception of the public.

<sup>1</sup> Disclosable pecuniary interests that must be declared are not only those of the member her or himself but also those of the member’s spouse, civil partner or person they are living with as husband or wife or as if they were civil partners.



**To: Value and Performance Scrutiny Committee**

**Date: 5<sup>th</sup> November 2012**

**Report of: Head of Law and Governance**

**Title of Report: CALL-IN - PARKING IN THE PARKS REVIEW**

## **Summary and Recommendations**

**Purpose of report:** To allow the Value and Performance Scrutiny Committee to review the decision of the City Executive Board at its meeting on 12<sup>th</sup> September, which has been called in by the Chair of this Committee.

**Key decision? No**

**Scrutiny Lead Member: Councillor Mark Mills**

**Executive lead member: Councillor Colin Cook**

**Recommendation(s):**

The Scrutiny Committee is asked to consider the call in request and either:-

- (a) Disagree with the call-in which will mean the original City Executive Board decision is made at this point; or,
- (b) Agree wholly or partly with the call-in and report to the next City Executive Board on 5<sup>th</sup> December 2012.

## **Introduction**

1. The Chair of the Value and Performance Scrutiny Committee has called in the decision of the City Executive Board on 12<sup>th</sup> September 2012 made following a review of charging for parking in parking areas adjacent to parks.
2. The reason for the call-in is that in making the decision consideration should have been given to:-
  - (i) The impact on neighbouring areas.
  - (ii) The balance between revenue from charges and penalties.

- (iii) Whether there are other factors in play which might be distorting the comparison of user numbers.

### **Scrutiny considerations**

- 3. To assist the Committee the following information is attached:

#### Original Decision Making

- (i) Report of the Head of Direct Services submitted to the City Executive Board on 12<sup>th</sup> September 2012;
- (ii) Extract from the minutes of the City Executive Board of 12<sup>th</sup> September 2012;

#### **The Impact on neighbouring areas**

- (iii) Members of the communities affected may attend to give comment to the Committee

#### **Balance of revenues**

- (iii) Income and penalties information for the period between September 2011 and 31<sup>st</sup> August 2012.

#### **Factors influencing user numbers**

- (iv) Further information has been requested from the Head of Leisure and Parks on factors such as improvements to parks and play areas and events which may have impacted on the usage of the parking areas.

The Head of Leisure and Parks has confirmed that the while all of the play areas have been refurbished, the refurbishment programme was already underway when the charges were introduced. All of the car parks were well used during the peak summer months and while events once again were held in the parks during the year, the number of events remained constant.

### **Options**

- 4. The Committee is asked to consider the reasons stated by the Chair when considering the call-in and to either:-
  - (a) Disagree with the call-in, which will mean the original City Executive Board decision is made at this point;
  - (b) Agree wholly or partly with the call-in and report to the next City Executive Board on 5<sup>th</sup> December 2012.



**Name and contact details of author:-**

Mathew Metcalfe on behalf of the Value and Performance Scrutiny Committee  
Democratic and Electoral Services Officer  
Law and Governance  
Tel: 01865 252214 e-mail: mmetcalfe@oxford.gov.uk

**List of background papers: None**

**Version number: 1**

This page is intentionally left blank

**To: City Executive Board**

**Date: 12<sup>th</sup> September 2012**

**Report of: Head of Direct Services**

**Title of Report: PARKING IN THE PARKS REVIEW**

### **Summary and Recommendations**

**Purpose of report:** To review the introduction of charging for Parking in selected Parks

**Key decision?** No

**Executive lead member:** Councillor Colin Cook

**Policy Framework:**

**Recommendation(s):** (1) To continue with charging at the existing sites and review tariffs during the normal off street parking process. (2) To note the ongoing maintenance issues and that provision for this will be made in the forthcoming budget process.

### **Background**

1. Charging for car parking within selected parks was agreed by Council during last years budget process. It was anticipated that charging would commence from 1<sup>st</sup> July 2011. A consultation process was undertaken and amendments were made to the proposed tariffs to accommodate the findings. A paper to Value and Performance Scrutiny Committee on 5<sup>th</sup> April 2011 detailed the findings and recommendations. Charging commenced on 1<sup>st</sup> September 2011 following the recommendations made in the report.
2. The delay in charging reflected additional time taken over the consultation and lead times required for changing parking orders and delivery of pay machines for each of the selected sites.
3. The parks subject to these parking tariffs are Walton Well Road, Alexandra Court, Hinksey Park and the two parks in Cutteslowe, (Harbord Road) and Cutteslowe A40.

4. The tariff structure is shown in the table in Appendix 2 attached to this report.

### **Usage Impact**

5. There is no precise data per park usage to compare pre and post charge. However, the Parks Service has not identified any reduction in usage as a result. Gate data supplied from Hinksey Park suggests that usage has risen in each comparative month from November to March.
6. Vehicle usage data is available since the introduction of charging and this will become more useful in determining usage and assist in setting future tariff rates. However, at present there is only 10 months of data to 30<sup>th</sup> June 2012. Vehicle usage data and income generated compared to budget is shown in Appendix 1.

### **Customer Feedback**

7. A small number of complaints have been received from residents not being able to park within Harbord Road. The claim is that Park users are using Harbord Road as an alternative to parking within the car park.
8. The County Council is currently consulting with residents in Harbord Road, as concerns have been raised regarding non-resident parking. The proposal is to install single yellow lines on Harbord Road, with a no waiting restriction being enforced between 9.00am – 5.00pm.
9. This restriction may assist the Council in achieving our desired revenue budget, as the enforcement undertaken may encourage usage of our facility.
10. The implementation of the charge in Alexandra Court has been successful in eliminating the overcrowding issues potentially caused by commuters that so often prevented Park users enjoying the facility.
11. The one negative response received regarding Alexandra Court was from the NHS staff who used this facility to park, and felt that they should be exempt from payment, or at least be eligible for the reduced permit rate.
12. NHS staff were advised that we would not be able to offer a reduction on the advertised tariff rates, and we recommended permits be purchased at the regular user tariff. The NHS Trust has now been issued with five permits charged at our regular user rates.

## **Financial Results**

13. The budgeted income for the sites for 2011/12 was £48K, after a reduction of £10K for permit concessions. This project was delayed by two months and did not commence until September 2011, which gave an immediate budget pressure. However, for the 2011/12 period of seven months, the sites have generated £44K in revenue, giving only a small shortfall in the year. See Appendix 1 for detail.
14. In the 3 months of 2012/13 income of £26.5K is in line with budget.
15. The full year income anticipated from these parks in the original appraisal was £70,431. Based on usage during 2011/12 the anticipated income for 2012/13 for these parks is £86,842.

## **Costs**

16. The capital sum of £109K was approved by Council during last year's budget process in the original report on December 2010 which related to eight sites. For those sites implemented, the budget was reduced to £67,250, which covered the installation costs.
17. We are still experiencing problems with vandalism and attempted thefts. To date, the Aura machines have not been penetrated and no revenue has been lost. However, a recent attack caused over £700 in damage. It should be noted that the remote location of these sites makes a future attack highly probable. A proportion of the increased income will need to be used for additional expenditure of this nature.
18. We are now taking steps to deter perpetrators in an attempt to discourage such attacks. We are also exploring the possibility of a modification being made to the existing stock of machines in an effort to enhance the security. This cost of this modification is being evaluated.

Financial details of the report approved by Lyn Barker.

## **Summary**

19. The introduction of charging does not appear to have had any detrimental affect on park usage. Vandalism was experienced following implementation and continues to be a challenge. The remote location of these sites leaves the machines vulnerable to attack. Modifications are currently being investigated that will increase the security, however it will not eliminate acts of vandalism.

20. Alexandra Court and Walton Well Road is performing above our budget expectation. Walton Well Road has performed better than first anticipated. This may be due to its close proximity to the city centre, as customers can walk into the city within ten minutes. It can also be very challenging for residents to find parking within this vicinity, residents may be utilising the car park for either personal or guest parking.
21. It is hoped that now the infrastructure is in place we will be able to capitalise on the summer season and meet budget requirements.

### **Recommendations**

22. To continue with charging at the existing sites and review tariffs during the normal off street parking process.
23. To note the ongoing maintenance issues and that provision for this will be made in the forthcoming budget process.

#### **Name and contact details of author:-**

Name **Roy Summers**  
Job title **Deputy Head of Direct Services**  
Service Area / Department **Direct Services**  
Tel: 01865 335408 e-mail: [rsummers@oxford.gov.uk](mailto:rsummers@oxford.gov.uk)

**List of background papers:**  
**Version number: 2**

## PARKING IN PARKS - INCOME

Financial Data

			2011/12		2012/13			
			Budget	Actual	Budget for Year	Budget to date	Actual to date	Actual for 10 months
No. of Spaces			£	£	£	£	£	£
<b>PARKING IN PARKS</b>								
Cuttleslowe- Harbord Road	FC03	60	23,012	9,855	26,703	9,001	6,369	16,224
Alexandra Court	FC04	26	4,128	8,790	8,996	2,550	6,625	15,415
Cuttleslowe - A40	FC05	45	4,021	12,003	10,000	3,550	5,039	17,042
Walton Well Road	FC57	28	5,008	7,966	22,579	5,900	4,391	12,357
Hinksey Park	FC58	42	14,263	5,655	18,566	5,253	4,099	9,754
Court Place - Marsh Lane	FC06		4,339					
Marsh Rec	FC08		3,722					
		<b>201</b>	<b>58,493</b>	<b>44,269</b>	<b>86,842</b>	<b>26,254</b>	<b>26,523</b>	<b>70,792</b>
			<b>10,000</b>					
			<b>48,493</b>					

6 Less Provision for Permits

**Note:**

- 1) 2011/12 Budget anticipated start date as 1st July 2011, actual charging commenced 1st September 2011.
- 2) 2012/13 Data for actual is for 3 months to 30th June 2012

Usage Data - 1st September 2011 to 30th June 2012

TARIFF TIMES	Cuttleslowe		Walton Well Road	Alexandra Court	Hinksey Park
	Harbord Road	A40			
0 - 1 hour	6082	2013	3792	1024	3888
1 - 3 hours	11052	3107	5437	2417	6557
3 - 5 hours	N/A	N/A	2644	1036	1290
5 - 24 hours	N/A	N/A	58	14	19
3 - 24 hours (Cuttleslowe)	1214	312	N/A	N/A	N/A
<b>TOTAL</b>	<b>18348</b>	<b>5432</b>	<b>11931</b>	<b>4491</b>	<b>11754</b>

This page is intentionally left blank



### Tariff Structure for Parking in Parks

Park Sites	Monday - Sunday			
	0 to 1 hour	1 to 3 hours	3 to 5 hours	5 to 24 hours
Alexandra Court	£0.50	£1.00	£2.00	£10.00
Hinksey Park	£0.50	£1.00	£2.00	£10.00
Walton Well Road	£0.50	£1.00	£2.00	£10.00
	0 to 1 hour	1 to 3 hours	3 to 24 hours	
Cuttleslowe - A40	£0.50	£1.00	£2.00	
Cuttleslowe - Harbord Road	£0.50	£1.00	£2.00	

**N.B. The 5 to 24 hours tariff of £10.00 was introduced to stop commuters using the car park as these sites are very close to the City Centre and could potentially be used for commuter parking**

### Permits

There are three types of permits available

- 1) Special Events - charged at £2 per day
- 2) Affiliated Club Permits - charged at £20.00 per year and can have up to 2 vehicles from the same family
- 3) Regular User Permits - for those not affiliated to clubs but use the specific park on a regular basis charged at £50.00 per year

This page is intentionally left blank

# **EXTRACT FROM THE MINUTES**

## **CITY EXECUTIVE BOARD**

Wednesday 12 September 2012

### **18. PARKING IN PARKING AREAS ADJACENT TO PARKS - MONITORING**

The Head of Direct Services submitted a report (previously circulated, now appended). Councillor Colin Cook presented the report to the City Executive Board.

Councillor Gotch addressed the meeting and expressed concern about the effect of displacement parking in various areas of the City. He suggested that this report should be deferred pending a monitoring exercise into the effect of displacement parking. City Executive Board noted his comments.

City Executive Board observed that it had not wished to charge for parking at parks; however there would additional pressure on budgets if it did not do so.

Resolved:-

- (1) To continue with charging at the existing sites and review tariffs during the normal off street parking process;
- (2) To note the ongoing maintenance issues and that provision for this will be made in the forthcoming budget process.

This page is intentionally left blank

Parking in the Parks Income September 2011 -31st August 2012

Income

		2011/12 September to March	
		Parking Charges	Penalties
Cuttleslowe		12,037	9,821
Alexandra Court	FC04	7,739	1,051
Court Place - Marsh Lane	FC06	-	-
Marsh Rec	FC08	-	-
Walton Well Road	FC57	7,966	-
Hinksey Park	FC58	5,655	-
<b>Total</b>		<b>33,397</b>	<b>10,872</b>

		2012/13 April to August	
		Parking Charges	Penalties
		18,551	6,197
		7,547	851
		-	-
		-	-
		8,005	-
		9,104	-
		<b>43,207</b>	<b>7,048</b>

		September 2011 - August 2012	
		Parking Charges	Penalties
		30,588	16,018
		15,286	1,902
		-	-
		-	-
		15,971	-
		14,759	-
		<b>76,604</b>	<b>17,920</b>

This page is intentionally left blank